

## Cover Page



# Universiteit Leiden



The handle <http://hdl.handle.net/1887/20181> holds various files of this Leiden University dissertation.

**Author:** Berkel, Tazuko van

**Title:** The economics of friendship : changing conceptions of reciprocity in classical Athens

**Date:** 2012-11-27

**The Economics of Friendship**  
**Changing conceptions of reciprocity**  
**in Classical Athens**

PROEFSCHRIFT

TER VERKRIJGING VAN  
DE GRAAD VAN DOCTOR AAN DE UNIVERSITEIT LEIDEN,  
OP GEZAG VAN DE RECTOR MAGNIFICUS PROF. MR. P.F. VAN DER HEIJDEN,  
HOOGLERAAR IN DE FACULTEIT DER RECHTSGELEERDHEID,  
VOLGENS BESLUIT VAN HET COLLEGE VOOR PROMOTIES  
TE VERDEDIGEN OP DINSDAG 27 NOVEMBER 2012  
KLOKKE 16.15 UUR

DOOR

TAZUKO ANGELA VAN BERKEL

GEBOREN TE LEIMUIDEN  
IN 1979

*Promotiecommissie*

promotor Prof. dr. I. Sluiter

Prof. dr. J. Blok (Universiteit Utrecht)

leden Prof. dr. K.A. Algra (Universiteit Utrecht)

Em. prof. dr. N.R.E. Fisher (Cardiff University)

Prof. dr. A.P.M.H. Lardinois (Radboud Universiteit Nijmegen)

Dr. F.G. Naerebout (Universiteit Leiden)

Dr. A.M. Rademaker (Universiteit Leiden)

Em. prof. dr. C. Risseuw (Universiteit Leiden)

# Preface

**A**LTHOUGH one never really seems to be prepared for the moment something is actually finished, one does occasionally indulge in writing prefaces. I have long been planning to point out the sheer irony of my dissertation topic: “Money and friendship,” I would say in a typically self-deprecatory vein, “whereas in my own life I seem to have neither!” The deeper irony is that it took me years of scholarship to realize that this would not only make my audience feel awkward and perhaps question my mental stability, but that it would also be very *ungrateful*.

Ingratitude, as I have come to understand, is a failure to acknowledge the truth of a situation—or other, equally relevant, truths of the same situation. It is the inability to see oneself as part of a larger whole. It is the behavior of a Compulsive Grumbler or a Generic PhD-student doomed to see the downside of things, weighed down by the idea that pessimism and cynicism are academic virtues, but momentarily forgetting that it is a privilege to have the opportunity to earn one’s living by exploring the ancient world and to be part of a flourishing and inspiring academic community. Throughout my graduate years I have greatly benefited from being part of this community—as part of a research community in OIKOS, but also as a full colleague and employee at the Leiden Department of Classics endowed with teaching responsibilities. It is uniquely characteristic of the Dutch university system that PhD-students are regarded as employees and I believe this to be an investment in human capital that deserves to be valued as more than an economic liability that can be abolished lightly in times of austerity measures.

In many cultures verbal expressions of gratitude are regarded as shallow substitutes for a deeper sense of obligation. In ancient Greek, however, verbal expressions of thanks are not substitutes for reciprocation, but signs that communicate that generosity and grace are acknowledged and will be

remembered until a suitable occasion for reciprocation arises. They are token and promise in one. It is in this spirit that I would like to express my gratitude: to my senior colleagues without whom it would have been impossible to write this dissertation; to my fellow PhD-students in Leiden and at OIKOS; to the undergraduate students for being eager to learn but prone to question everything I try to teach them; to Albert, Casper, Chiara, Christina, Lina and Lucien for being my sparring partners; to my fellow fellows at NIAS, especially Arjo, Erik, Jan H. and Joy, for telling me that it is OK to be a classicist and that my research matters; to my friends; to my “paranymphs” Han and Saskia for being my brothers in arms; to my family, especially my parents for teaching me that curiosity is not just a rover on Mars; to Jan, who never stopped being a kind and generous friend; to Mathilde, for teaching me that sometimes curiosity *is* a rover on Mars; to Anne, who was always there for me, who kept the music in my life and reminded me that it has never been my duty to remake the world at large.

# Contents

## INTRODUCTION

<b>THE ECONOMICS OF FRIENDSHIP</b>	<b>1</b>
1. Friendship: Money can't buy it?	6
2. Φιλία	11
2.1. Forms and norms of φιλία-reciprocity	11
2.2. The scope and charge of φιλία-vocabulary	15
2.3. Objective vs. subjective ties	20
3. An economic mentality	22
3.1. The transformation of the Athenian economy	22
3.2. Money and commerce I: against the creation myth of money	28
3.3. Money and commerce II: Greek thinking about money	34
4. Reciprocity	40
4.1. Definitions and types of reciprocity	40
4.2. Long-term vs. short-term	44
4.3. Gifts vs. Commodities	46
5. Plan of this book	48

## PART I

### The Analysis of Exchange

#### CHAPTER ONE

<b>GRACE UNDER PRESSURE. THE ANATOMY OF χάρις</b>	<b>55</b>
1. Three cases of isomorphism	57
1.1. Case 1: χάρις in erotics, the verbal icing on the cake of vice?	58
1.2. Case 2: χάρις in religious communication, a mere name for commerce?	59
1.3. Case 3: χάρις in lending and borrowing, an "as if"?	61
1.4. The ban on reductionism	63
2. χάρις and successful interaction	64
2.1. Successful interaction between beauty and beholder	68
2.2. Successful interaction between giver and recipient	63
2.3. The embodiment of χάρις: knowing vs. showing	79

## CONTENTS

3.	Perception and <i>méconnaissance</i>	81
3.1.	The puzzle of obligation	81
3.2.	To see and not to see: <i>méconnaissance</i>	84
4.	Conflicts and cynicism	93
4.1.	Temporal perspective: balance sheets	95
4.2.	Focalization: cynicism	98
5.	Concluding Remarks	101

## CHAPTER TWO

### PRINCIPLES OF CHARITY SOME STRATEGIES OF DEMARCATION 103

1.	Debt vs. <i>χάρις</i>	108
1.1	The most binding of obligations	108
1.2.	The law of gratitude	110
2.	Cleaning the pebbles or washing them away	115
3.	Alternative commerce	119
3.1.	Short- vs. long-term	119
3.2.	The fuzzy mathematics of the long-term	121
4.	Necessity vs. <i>χάρις</i>	124
4.1.	Above and beyond the call of duty	124
4.2.	“ <i>χάρις</i> abhors intolerable necessity”	129
5.	The moral icing on the cake	130
5.1.	Interest-free credit	130
5.2.	Customer relation maintenance	133
6.	Indebtedness Engineering and Symbolic Violence	134
6.1.	Irredeemable <i>χάρις</i> and <i>χάρις</i> gone bad	134
6.2.	Symbolic violence	138
6.3.	The misrecognition of power	140
7.	Concluding Remarks	144

## CHAPTER THREE

### NOT FOR SALE? ARISTOTLE ON RECIPROCITY 147

1.	Utility friendship	151
1.1.	Deficiency, need and utility	151
1.2.	Mutual exploitation or mutual benefit?	155
1.3.	The consequences of isomorphism	160

## CONTENTS

2.	The Debtor Paradigm of Obligation	161
2.1.	The analytical use of isomorphism	161
2.2.	Problems of perspective	164
3.	Constructing the informal	168
3.1.	Law vs. moral character in Aristotle	168
3.2.	Character-based utility friendship: a hybrid or perspective problem?	173
4.	The problem of measurement	179
4.1.	Money as a common measure: Aristotle's theory of value	179
4.2.	Means and ends	185
4.3.	The incommensurability of utility, pleasure and virtue	187
4.4.	Subjectivity and value formation	190
5.	Preserving incommensurability	193
5.1.	The incommensurability of τιμή and utility	193
5.2.	Symbolic economy	195
6.	Concluding remarks	199

## **PART II**

### **The Morality of Exchange**

#### **CHAPTER FOUR**

<b>PRICING THE INVALUABLE.</b>		
<b>SOCRATES AND THE VALUE OF FRIENDSHIP</b>		<b>203</b>
1.	Framing Socratic Conversation	204
1.1.	Socrates versus Antiphon	204
1.2.	Some notes on the commodification of wisdom and virtue	211
2.	Friendship and the Discourse of Commerce	212
3.	Redefining Value and Utility	215
3.1	Utility and use: ancient and modern conceptualizations	215
3.2	The Socratic conception of utility and use	217
4.	Commerce vs. Estate Management	221
4.1.	Beyond the egoism/altruism debate	221
4.2.	Estate management	222
4.3.	Unfit friends	224
4.4.	ἐγκράτεια	225
4.5.	Heracles' choice	228



5. Concluding Remarks	231
-----------------------	-----

## CHAPTER FIVE

<b>ACTIVE PARTNERSHIP.</b>	
<b>SOCRATES AND THE ART OF SEDUCTION</b>	<b>233</b>
1. The Socratic Principle: pay it forward	236
2. Amazing Grace: looking as a reciprocal endeavor	240
2.1. The look of love: χάρις and display	240
2.2. Erotic χάρις	244
2.3. Hetaeras and prostitutes	249
3. The hunter hunted: role reversals and the paradox of the hetaera	254
3.1. Hunting without violence	254
3.2. <i>Mem.</i> II.vi: hunting “friends”	256
3.3. Who is hunting whom?	259
3.4. The hunting sophist: a didactic turn	260
4. Desire management	264
4.1. Beneath the veil of words	264
4.2. Playing hard to get: χάρις deflated	269
5. The secrets of Love Magic	272
5.1. Socrates the co-hunter	272
5.2. <i>Mem.</i> II.iii and II.vi: Love Magic	276
5.3. Playing hard to get vs. Love Magic	279
6. Concluding remarks	281
<b>EPILOGUE</b>	<b>285</b>
1. “It works both ways”: constructions of the market	288
2. Emotion management	291
<b>BIBLIOGRAPHY</b>	<b>297</b>
<b>SAMENVATTING</b>	<b>335</b>
<b>CURRICULUM VITAE</b>	<b>344</b>